

Moray Citizens' Panel

Report on Panel Refreshment as at September 2014

Chris Thornton, Craigforth

Moray's Citizens' Panel was established in 2005, and is managed by Craigforth on behalf of the Moray Community Planning Partnership. The Panel offers a means of gauging local residents' views across a range of issues, and using a mix of consultation methodologies. Citizens' Panel consultation findings have been used by MCPP members to inform local policy, strategy and service development.

The Refreshment Process

Regular refreshment of the Citizens' Panel membership is recognised as good practice to maintain engagement levels amongst Panel members, and also to ensure that the Panel is fit for purpose in terms of its representation of the wider Moray population. The last Citizens' Panel refreshment exercise was undertaken in 2010/11, although the Panel remains open to new members all year round and there have been a small number of new members join since the 2010/11 exercise.

The MCPP identified a need for a further large scale refreshment exercise. Planning for the exercise began in April 2014, with the main large scale postal recruitment strand going live in summer 2014. Overall, the exercise sought to replace around half of the current Panel membership (450-500 new members). The approach taken was modified from that used in 2010/11 to incorporate a more substantial promotion-based recruitment strand – the table below provides further detail on the main work strands.

Summary of Refreshment Work Strands

Strand	Summary of approach and timescale
i. Identification of current Panel members to be replaced	<p>Selection of current Panel members to be removed from the Panel focused primarily on the longest-standing members - previous research has suggested that membership of a Panel-type body can cause individuals to become "less typical" of the wider population over time, and as such we seek to limit the length of an individual's membership.</p> <p>Selection also took some account of the Panel's representation of Moray's population, using a quota approach to select a higher proportion of members within over-represented groups.</p> <p>This was undertaken in early May prior to large scale postal recruitment.</p>

Strand		Summary of approach and timescale
ii.	Large scale postal recruitment	<p>Large scale recruitment of new Citizens' Panel members via mailing of recruitment packs to 5735 Moray residents, selected from the edited Electoral Register.</p> <p>A random stratified recruitment sample was structured to maintain a broadly even spread of Panel members across the seven ward-based areas, and to ensure sufficient numbers of members to permit analysis of consultation results by area. This stratification took account of area variation in response to previous recruitment exercises. The recruitment sample also sought to boost representation of males on the Panel.</p> <p>The recruitment fieldwork commenced in late May 2014.</p>
iii.	Ongoing promotion-based recruitment	<p>Use of promotional recruitment to maximise the reach of the Panel refreshment exercise, and to focus on specific under-represented population groups.</p> <p>A set of promotional materials were developed, including flyers, press releases, adverts for inclusion in newsletters and similar, and text for inclusion on websites. These materials are being used to promote Panel membership through a range of routes including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local press advertising in the Banffshire Advertiser, Banffshire Herald, Forres Gazette and Northern Scot (June 2014). • Inclusion of an advert in a forthcoming Council tenant newsletter (to be issued in autumn 2014). • Promotion through the Council and partner websites (commenced summer 2014, ongoing). • Promotion through local businesses/employers and community organisations, including those working with specific population groups (ongoing). • Promotion to younger people through Moray College UHI (autumn 2014). <p>The promotional work began in June 2014 and will continue into autumn 2014 – although Panel membership will remain open throughout the year.</p>
iv.	Updating data on retained Panel members	<p>The first Panel survey following refreshment will be used to ask current members retained on the Panel to update contact details and demographic information.</p>

Response

A total of **322 new members** have joined the Citizens' Panel to date, representing an overall response rate of 5.6%. The recruitment fieldwork remains open, and new members continue to come in, and are likely to further increase Panel membership over the coming weeks. Nevertheless, at this stage the recruitment response is somewhat lower than that seen in 2010/11 (6.2%). The level of response varies at a local level, with the lower than anticipated response being driven to a large extent by a fall in response in the Elgin (-1.2% down on 2010/11) and Lossiemouth (-2.3%) areas.

At present, the number of new members achieved remains below the target of 450-500 individuals. While this is significant for the effectiveness of the Citizens' Panel (the volume of Panel consultation responses is a key driver of the robustness of results), ***we anticipate that continuing response to the various recruitment strands over the coming weeks will achieve the 450-500 target.*** This includes significant elements of the promotion-based recruitment work yet to come on line – including promotion through schools the Council's tenant newsletter. We would expect these to add relatively substantial numbers to the Panel over this period.

Response to Panel Recruitment

	Recruitment packs issued	New members	% Response	2010/11 response
TOTAL	5735	322	5.6%	6.2%
Buckie	1263	44	3.5%	4.3%
Elgin	706	43	6.1%	7.3%
Fochabers	665	41	6.2%	6.7%
Forres	674	62	9.2%	6.4%
Keith	1123	47	4.2%	4.9%
Lossiemouth	607	38	6.3%	8.6%
Speyside	697	47	6.7%	6.6%

Profile of the Refreshed Panel – key points of note

As noted earlier, a key aim of the Panel refreshment exercise is to maximise the effectiveness of the membership in terms of representing the wider Moray population. The focus here is on ensuring that the Citizens' Panel provides a reasonable balance of members across all parts of the community, and has sufficient numbers within specific demographic groups for which robust consultation results may be required (for example area, age, gender, etc). It is important to note that it is unrealistic to expect a Panel-type body to be "fully accurate" in its representation of all parts of the wider population - not least due to the very considerable expense of quota-based recruitment exercises. Moreover, there are mechanisms in place to ensure that appropriate weighting is undertaken to ensure results for specific consultation exercises are not significantly affected by any "bias" in the profile of Panel members.

In this context, we have highlighted below the key points of note in relation to the profile of the refreshed Citizens' Panel membership. This has a particular focus on groups which will be a particular focus for our ongoing promotion-based recruitment work – where the Panel significantly under-represents the wider population and/or where membership numbers may be too low for focused consultation or survey analysis.

- The refreshed Citizens' Panel membership is broadly representative of the wider population across most demographic groups. This includes in relation to ***gender, ethnicity, disability, and employment status*** with the Panel showing improved membership across a number of previously under-represented groups (such as males and those in paid employment).

- The refreshment exercise has achieved a broadly even distribution of Panel members across the seven **ward-based areas**. This will ensure that Panel surveys can produce meaningful results at a small area level.
- This latest recruitment process sought to gather information for the first time on **religion, relationship status** and **sexual orientation** – as such, this information is available for new members only. Nevertheless, this indicates that new members are broadly representative of the wider population in terms of religion and sexual orientation. New members somewhat under-represent single people.
- The refreshed Panel under-represents the **population aged under 35** (by -18%). This is the most significant area of under-representation for the membership, and is primarily due to a small number of Panel members aged 18 to 24. Although it is not uncommon for Panel-type mechanisms (and indeed public consultations more widely) to under-represent younger residents, clearly further boosting of Panel membership within this age group is required. This will be a particular focus for our ongoing promotional work through Moray College UHI and local employers.
- Those **living in rented accommodation** are the other population group significantly under-represented by the refreshed Panel membership – by -9% for both social renters and private renters. Again this is not uncommon for Citizens’ Panels and other forms of public consultation. We would expect forthcoming promotion through the Council’s tenant newsletter, supplemented by promotion through other local Registered Social Landlords, to boost representation of social renters specifically. Boosting membership within the private rented sector is likely to be more challenging – promotion through local employers is likely to reach some private renters but we would recommend further, more targeted promotion through other services working directly with the sector.
- Although the refreshed Panel is proportionately representative of Moray’s **minority ethnic population**, the number of members across these population groups remains small. There may be scope for further, targeted promotion work through local services and voluntary organisations working specifically with the ethnic minority population to further boost membership here.

The Panel refreshment exercise also sought to gather information on members’ communication preferences, particularly in relation to interest in **completing Panel surveys online**. Based on this feedback, and taking into account those Panel members who provided an email address, we estimate that 52% of the refreshed membership should receive online surveys. This represents a substantial saving in production and postage costs, and there may be scope to further increase the proportion of members receiving online surveys as the first survey asks retained Panel members to indicate any interest in online surveys.

Tables over the following pages provide detail on the profile of the refreshed Citizens’ Panel, including for new recruits specifically, and compares this with that of the Moray population (where available).

Profile of Refreshed Panel, Comparison with Moray Population

GEOGRAPHIC AREA	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Buckie	44	14%	131	14%	10%	4%
Elgin	43	13%	139	14%	22%	-7%
Fochabers	41	13%	141	15%	13%	1%
Forres	62	19%	166	17%	17%	0%
Keith	47	15%	129	13%	12%	2%
Lossiemouth	38	12%	120	12%	17%	-5%
Speyside	47	15%	143	15%	10%	5%

Source: GROS MYE 2011

GENDER	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Female	157	49%	498	51%	51%	0%
Male	164	51%	470	49%	49%	0%
Transgender	1	0.3%	1	0.1%	-	-

Source: GROS MYE 2011

AGE PROFILE	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Under 35	33	10%	64	7%	24%	-18%
35-44	42	13%	158	16%	16%	1%
45-54	84	26%	243	25%	19%	6%
55-64	85	27%	280	29%	16%	13%
65-69	33	10%	114	12%	8%	4%
70+	41	13%	101	11%	17%	-6%
Unknown	4		9			

Source: GROS MYE 2011

ETHNICITY	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
White – Scottish	213	67%	671	70%	78%	-8%
White – other British	78	25%	244	26%	18%	8%
White – other	14	4%	22	2%	3%	-1%
Mixed / multiple ethnic origin	2	1%	6	1%	0.3%	0%
Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British	2	1%	3	0.3%	1%	0%
African, Caribbean or Black		0%	1	0.1%	0.2%	0%
Other ethnic group	7	2%	9	1%	0.1%	1%
Unknown	6		13			

Source: 2011 Census

PLACE OF BIRTH	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Moray	91	29%	282	29%	75%	-7%
Elsewhere in Scotland	113	36%	368	38%		
Elsewhere in the UK	87	27%	263	28%	19%	8%
Outside the UK	26	8%	43	4%	5%	-1%
Unknown	5		13			

Source: 2011 Census

RELIGION	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
None	125	40%	-	-	41%	-
Church of Scotland	114	36%	-	-	50%	-
Roman Catholic	20	6%	-	-		
Other Christian	40	13%	-	-		
Buddhist	2	1%	-	-	0.2%	-
Hindu	1	0.3%	-	-	0.1%	-
Jewish		0%	-	-	0.1%	-
Muslim	1	0.3%	-	-	0.3%	-
Sikh		0%	-	-	0.003%	-
Other religion	11	4%	-	-	1%	-
Unknown/Not stated	8		-	-	8%	-

New addition to 2014 recruitment form, data available for new members only
Source: 2011 Census

RELATIONSHIP STATUS	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Single (never married)	35	11%	-	-	29%	-
Married	205	64%	-	-	52%	-
Living with partner	30	9%	-	-	-	-
Separated, divorced or widowed	48	15%	-	-	19%	-
Unknown	4		-	-	-	-

New addition to 2014 recruitment form, data available for new members only
Source: 2011 Census

SEXUAL ORIENTATION	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Bisexual	4	1%	-	-	1%	-
Gay/Lesbian	1	0.3%	-	-	-	-
Heterosexual/Straight	301	98%	-	-	99%	-
Unknown	16		-	-		

New addition to 2014 recruitment form, data available for new members only
Source: Scottish Household Survey 2012

DISABILITY	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
No disability/health problem	277	86%	825	85%	82%	3%
1 or more disability/health problem	45	14%	144	15%	18%	-3%
Impaired hearing	13	4%	38	4%	-	-
Impaired or partial sight/ blindness	5	2%	17	2%	-	-
Problems with physical mobility	24	7%	82	8%	-	-
Mental health difficulties*	8	2%	8	1%	-	-
Learning difficulties*	3	1%	3	0.3%	-	-
Other	3	1%	29	3%	-	-

*** New additions to 2014 recruitment form, data available for new members only**
Source: 2011 Census

EMPLOYMENT STATUS	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Full-time paid employment	119	38%	327	34%	35%	-1%
Part-time paid employment	39	12%	137	14%	11%	3%
Self employed	32	10%	91	10%	8%	2%
Government sponsored scheme	1	0.3%	2	0.2%	-	-
Unemployed	9	3%	14	1%	2%	-1%
Retired	88	28%	293	31%	30%	1%
Student	4	1%	8	1%	7%	-6%
Permanently sick or disabled	4	1%	26	3%	3%	0%
Looking after home and family	11	4%	29	3%	4%	-1%
Voluntary unpaid work	3	1%	12	1%	-	-
Other	3	1%	12	1%	-	-
Unknown	9		18			

Source: Scottish Household Survey 2012 – not directly comparable as SHS 2012 includes those aged 16/17

HOUSEHOLD TYPE	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
1 adult, no children	64	20%	171	18%	33%	-15%
1 adult with children	10	3%	22	2%	7%	-5%
2 adults, no children	131	41%	441	46%	35%	11%
2 adults, with children	55	17%	150	16%	15%	1%
Other, no children	45	14%	123	13%	10%	3%
Other, with children	12	4%	44	5%	6%	-2%
Unknown	5		18			

Source: Scottish Household Survey 2012 – not SHS 2012 household groupings not directly comparable

HOUSING TENURE	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Owner occupier	248	78%	778	85%	67%	18%
Social rented	35	11%	78	9%	18%	-9%
Private rented/other	34	11%	56	6%	15%	-9%
Unknown	5		57		-	-

Source: 2011 Census

TIME IN MORAY	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)		Population	Panel vs Population
Less than 1 year	5	2%	-	-	-	-
1-5 years	31	10%	-	-	-	-
5+ years	265	88%	-	-	-	-
Unknown	21				-	-

New addition to 2014 recruitment form, data available for new members only

ENGAGEMENT PREFERENCES	New Recruits to date (322)		Refreshed Panel (969)	
Online surveys	223	69%	508	52%
Postal surveys	99	31%	461	48%
Combines stated preference with provision of valid email address				
Interested in face-to-face interview	185	57%	513	53%
Interested in telephone interview	171	53%	482	50%
Interested in group discussions	204	63%	560	58%